

Research Article



## Evaluation Of The Implementation Of Health Protocol Policies During The Covid-19 Pandemic In Ternate And Tidore Cities

Muliana<sup>1</sup>, Faisal Pataha<sup>2</sup>, Muhamad Sahiddin<sup>3\*</sup>

<sup>1,2</sup> *Department of Nursing Health Polytechnic of the Ministry of Health of Ternate, Ternate, Indonesia*

<sup>3</sup> *Department of Nursing Health Polytechnic of the Ministry of Health of Jayapura, Jayapura, Indonesia*

Corresponding Author :

Muhamad Sahiddin

Department of Nursing Health Polytechnic of the Ministry of Health of Jayapura Indonesia.

E-mail: [msahiddin@gmail.com](mailto:msahiddin@gmail.com)

### ABSTRACT

**Background :** Indonesia first confirmed cases of COVID-19 in March 2020, were 1,528 cases and 136 cases with a mortality rate much higher than that of the People's Republic of China (8.9% vs 4%) Indonesian health facilities are not ready. Objective: To find out the differences in the evaluation model of the Covid 19 health protocol policy in Ternate and Tidore.

**Methods:** Quantitative with a cross sectional study, with a sample of 200 people, data collection through observation and interviews in July-September 2022, and statistical analysis using the Mann Whitney test.

**Results:** The results showed that there were differences in the level of policy implementation from the aspect of resources ( $p < 0.05$ ), bureaucracy ( $p < 0.05$ ) and disposition ( $p < 0.05$ ) in the cities of Ternate and Tidore, but not for the communication aspect ( $p < 0.05$ ).  $p > 0.05$ .

**Conclusions:** There are differences in the health protocol policy model for the Covid 19 City of Ternate and the City. Suggestions: improve human resource skills and improve the readiness of facilities and infrastructure, SOPs and reporting systems are more structured, it is better to provide standard information delivery procedures and procedures for communication between related agencies, socialization should be carried out more widely and evenly, especially in the islands.

**Keyword :** Covid-19, Health Protocol, Policy Implementation

## INTRODUCTION

This corona virus or Covid-19 first appeared in the city of Wuhan, the People's Republic of China at the end of 2019. There is confusion about the spread of this virus, starting from animals, food, or other reasons. The national health commission later confirmed that the virus can spread from person to person or can stick to objects that infected people come into contact with. A 34-year-old doctor in the city of Wuhan, Li Wenliang, had informed his medical school alumni group through the short message application, WeChat. "Seven patients from the local seafood market have been diagnosed with a SARS-like illness and are quarantined in his hospital (1).

Indonesia first confirmed cases of COVID-19 in early March 2020, until the end of March 2020, there were 1,528 cases of COVID-19 in Indonesia and 136 cases with a mortality rate (CFR) much higher than that of the People's Republic of China (8.9% vs 4%) Indonesian health facilities are not ready to deal with COVID-19 (2). Massive preparations should be taken seriously at the start of the disease spreading in the People's Republic of China (3). Professor Joseph Wu warned all parties in early January 2020 in The Lancet. At that time, the authors stated that the 2019-nCoV could become a global epidemic (4).

The latest data on October 23, 2020, the number of positive COVID-19 reached 381,910, recovered 305,100 and died 13,077 people is ranked 19 out of 217 countries infected with Covid(5). As of October 24, 2020, the number of Covid-19 spreads in North Maluku Province was 2,188 Number of Positive Cases (0.6% of the national confirmed number), 186 active, 1928 recovered and 74 died. For the City of Ternate the number of confirmed cases was

838, 781 recovered and 21 died, while in Tidore Islands City 332 confirmed, 280 recovered and 19 died (6). Most (95%) of patients who died in North Maluku Province were elderly and suffered from hypertension, diabetes, heart, cancer, kidney and several other congenital diseases (comorbid) (Covid-19 Task Force, 2020), the mortality rate of covid patients 19 in North Maluku is relatively small compared to the national average. This has received praise from the head of the COVID-19 task force front group.

Due to the massive spread of COVID-19 in Indonesia, the government issued PP No. 21 of 2020 concerning PSBB as an operation of Law no. 6 of 2018 concerning Health Quarantine and PERPU No. 1 of 2020 for the Handling of the Corona Virus Disease 2019 (Covid-19) Pandemic and/or in the context of dealing with threats that endanger the National Economy and/or Financial System. The Perpu is interesting because the President subjectively considers there is a compelling urgency in terms of the impact of the Covid-19 Pandemic. Then came the new habit adaptation policy as stated in the Decree of the Minister of Health No. HK 01.07/Menkes/382/2020 concerning Health Protocols for the Community in Public Places and Facilities in the Context of Prevention and Control of Corona Virus Disease 2019 (Covid-19).

North Maluku Province is the province with the highest recovery rate above the national average of 89.71%, not only that, the government also appreciates the steps and efforts of the North Maluku Provincial Government in handling COVID-19 in implementing health protocol policies with a health-based approach. local wisdom(7). Therefore, based on the description of the data that has been presented, researchers are

interested in analyzing the implementation of government policies on compliance with health protocols during the COVID-19 period (case studies of Ternate and Tidore).

## METHOD

The method used in this study is a quantitative method with a cross sectional study design. The research location is the City of Ternate and the City of Tidore. The time of the research will be carried out in July-September 2022. The population in this study is the people in the cities of Ternate and Tidore, with the number of samples in this study as many as 200 respondents. The research instrument is in the form of a general characteristic questionnaire and policy implementation, based on individual and community levels, which is prepared by the Director General of Disease Prevention and Control. As for data collection through observation, interviews and literature study, the research results were analyzed using SPSS with the Mann Whitney test.

## RESULTS

The research was conducted in the cities of Ternate and Tidore on -30 July 2022-30 September 2022. The results of this study include an overview of the study, bivariate analysis. The results of the general overview of the study describe the characteristics of respondents and variables in the study. Bivariate analysis in the form of cross tabulation and differences in the implementation of the Covid 19 health

protocol policy in the City of Ternate and the City of Tidore.

**Table 1 . Distribution of Respondents by Gender, Marital Status and Age and City**

| Variable              | n   | %    |
|-----------------------|-----|------|
| Gender                |     |      |
| Man                   | 94  | 47.0 |
| Female                | 106 | 53.0 |
| <b>Marital Status</b> |     |      |
| Unmarried             | 41  | 20.5 |
| Married               | 159 | 79.5 |
| <b>Age (Year)</b>     |     |      |
| 10-19                 | 5   | 2.5  |
| 20-29                 | 42  | 21.0 |
| 30-39                 | 37  | 18.5 |
| 40-49                 | 72  | 36.0 |
| 50-59                 | 31  | 15.5 |
| ≥60                   | 13  | 6.5  |
| <b>City</b>           |     |      |
| Ternate               | 100 | 50.0 |
| Tidore                | 100 | 50.0 |

Source : Primary Data, 2022

Table 1 shows that the gender of the respondents is more female as much as 106 (53%) than male as much as 94 (47%). For the marital status of respondents, more in the married category as many as 159 (79.5%) compared to the unmarried category as many as 41 (20.5%). For the age of respondents more in the category of 40-49 years as many as 72 (36%), then 20-29 years as many as 42 (21%), 30-39 years as many as 37 (18.5%), 50-59 years as many as 31 (15.5%), 60 years as many as 13 (6.5%), and only 5 (2.5%) respondents aged 10-19 years. For distribution based on city of origin, 100 (50%) respondents were from Ternate City and 100 (50%) other respondents were from Tidore.

**Table 2. Cross Tabulation of Communication, Resources, Bureaucracy, Disposition**

| Variable             | City    |      |        |      | Total | Pvalue |       |
|----------------------|---------|------|--------|------|-------|--------|-------|
|                      | Ternate |      | Tidore |      |       |        |       |
|                      | n       | %    | n      | %    |       |        |       |
| <b>Communication</b> |         |      |        |      |       |        |       |
| Effective            | 65      | 52.8 | 58     | 47.2 | 123   | 100    | 0.260 |
| Less Effective       | 35      | 45.5 | 42     | 54.5 | 77    | 100    |       |
| <b>Resource</b>      |         |      |        |      |       |        |       |
| Enough               | 93      | 85.3 | 16     | 14.7 | 109   | 100    | 0.000 |
| Not                  | 7       | 7.7  | 84     | 92.3 | 91    | 100    |       |
| <b>Bureaucracy</b>   |         |      |        |      |       |        |       |
| Enough               | 89      | 89.9 | 10     | 10.1 | 99    | 100    | 0.000 |
| Not                  | 11      | 10.9 | 90     | 89.1 | 101   | 100    |       |
| <b>Disposition</b>   |         |      |        |      |       |        |       |
| Effective            | 89      | 89.0 | 11     | 11.0 | 100   | 100    | 0.000 |
| Less Effective       | 11      | 11.0 | 89     | 89.0 | 100   | 100    |       |

Source : Primary Data, 2022

Table 2 shows that based on the communication variable, there are more effective categories in Ternate City, namely 65 (52.8%) respondents, compared to 58 (47.2%) respondents in Tidore, while less effective communication is more in Tidore, namely 42 (54.4%). ) respondents compared to Ternate City as many as 35 (45.5%) respondents, although cross tabulation of effective communication is more in Ternate and less effective is more in Tidore, but the results of statistical tests show p value > 0.05 (0.260) which means no significant difference between the two cities.

For sufficient resources, there tend to be more in Ternate City, namely 93 (85.3%) respondents and 26 (24.7%) respondents in Tidore, while the category of less resources tends to be more in Tidore, namely 84 (92.3%) respondents compared to Ternate City which only 7 (7.7%) respondents. The statistical test results also showed a p value < 0.05 (0.000) which means there is a significant difference between the two cities of Ternate and Tidore. For bureaucracy in the fairly good category, there tend to be

more in Ternate City, namely 89 (89.9%) respondents and only 10 (10.1%) respondents in Tidore, while the less good category tends to be more in Tidore, namely 90 (89.0%) respondents compared to Ternate City. which only 11 (10.9%) respondents. The statistical test results also showed a p value < 0.05 (0.000) which means there is a significant difference between the two cities of Ternate and Tidore. For attitudes/dispositions that are in the effective category tend to be more in the City of Ternate, namely 89 (89.9%) respondents and only 11 (11.0%) respondents in Tidore, while the less effective category tends to be more in Tidore, namely 89 (89.0%) respondents than in the City. Ternate which only 11 (11.0%) respondents. The statistical test results also showed a p value < 0.05 (0.000) which means there is a significant difference between the two cities of Ternate and Tidore.

**DISCUSSION**

The results of this study indicate that there are differences in implementation in

terms of resources, bureaucracy, attitudes/dispositions, but there is no difference in communication. There are more resources in Ternate in the sufficient category, compared to Tidore, which are more in the less enough category. Meanwhile, policy implementation must be supported by the availability of resources (human, material, and method). In contrast to other aspects of policy implementation (resources, bureaucracy, and attitudes/dispositions), the results of this study show that there is no difference in terms of communication aspects related to the prevention and control of infectious diseases, between the cities of Ternate and Tidore. Established effective and efficient communication between stakeholders in carrying out the implementation of policies related to Covid 19 Health protocols.

Regarding the absence of differences in communication aspects in the cities of Ternate and Tidore and the answers of respondents who answered effectively were still quite low, namely 52.8% in Ternate and 47.2% in Tidore, indicating the need to evaluate good and effective communication methods to the community in the successful implementation of prevention and control policies. infectious diseases in the two regions. The implementation of public policies needs to be carried out carefully, clearly and consistently, but if the implementers lack the necessary resources, then the implementation of policies will tend not to be implemented effectively. Sufficient resources in Ternate strongly support the successful implementation of policies in the prevention and control of infectious diseases. The results of this study indicate that there are differences in resources in Ternate and Tidore.

Meanwhile, the resources in question are human resources, both the Task Force Team in particular or other stakeholders who work together to carry out the enforcement of Health protocols and material resources. The human resources involved are very committed to carrying out their respective duties. However, it is different from Tidore where based on the results of this study, it shows that most of the respondents answered that the resources in Tidore are still lacking, this is in line with the results of this study. Abujuri and Rahayu (8) which stated that based on the results of interviews it was concluded that the number of health workers in implementing the program was only one person as a manager, but when there was a case the managers together went down with the regional development that had been formed so that judging from the line of resources it could be fulfilled because the work was done simultaneously.

Many countries have implemented various human resource policies in combating pandemics or infectious diseases(9). Research on an infectious disease by Oo, Hoban (10) explained that FGD participants wanted to get basic health services for general health problems in the village 24/7, and get the same quality of service from every volunteer. To meet these needs, volunteers need training and support. Training of malaria volunteers for a variety of common health issues will give the community more choice of providers. Several volunteers in the same community can provide technical support and share medical commodities which will prevent commodity shortages. The demands and needs of the community for the need for quality health services are overcome by improving the quality of human resources. Therefore, human resources, especially in the

health sector, play an important role as a source of encouragement for programs in the health sector, so a revision of the mapping, distribution of monitoring of health personnel resources is needed(11).

The quality of human resources determines the quality of the process to be carried out, so as to produce good goals(12). In addition to the revision of health personnel resources, no less important is the budget(13). Funding for the implementation of the Health protocol policy in the City of Ternate is sourced from regional funds, bosses, and bosses. Funding from the point of view of service providers is a major issue for the government or the private sector, especially in health services. The main requirement is the availability of sufficient funds, so that it can finance the implementation of the necessary health efforts and does not make it difficult for people who want to use them. In addition, the distribution and utilization must be in accordance with the needs and the arrangement must be careful so that there is no waste in the budget(14).

As for the bureaucratic aspect, there are differences between the cities of Ternate and Tidore, which are mostly in the fairly good category in Ternate, compared to Tidore, which are mostly in the poor category. Based on the data obtained in the field, the implementation of the Covid Health protocol policy in the cities of Ternate and Tidore was in accordance with the procedures, all responsibilities were in the form of report documents and a team was formed for the acceleration of COVID-19 based on Perwali No. 7 of 2020 and Perwali number 20 of 2020 for guidance in implementing covid health protocol. It's just that there are other factors that affect the implementation of health protocols in the

field, such as the distance of Tidore which is far from the city center, so that there is no supervision in implementing policies that are not the same as the City of Ternate.

However, basically regulations issued by the government as a legal umbrella that must be obeyed by all levels of society. The regulation consists of various policies issued by the central government to regulate the community during this pandemic. One of these policies is regulation in the field of education. Every policy must be implemented in achieving its objectives by the policy implementer. Effective policy implementation is not only related to the mechanism of translating political decisions into routine procedures through bureaucratic channels, but more than that, issues of conflict, decisions and who gets what from the policy (15).

For the attitude/disposition aspect, the results of this study also show that there are differences in policy implementation in terms of attitude/disposition in Ternate and Tidore, which are more in the effective category in Ternate City, on the contrary in Tidore where most respondents answered in the less effective category. The disposition or attitude of the implementers will cause support or obstacles to the implementation of the policy depending on the suitability of the competencies and attitudes of the implementers. Based on Perwali No. 20 of 2002, the Mayor through the Ternate City Health Office conducted socialization related to information/education on how to prevent and control Covid-19 to the public.

The implementation of the socialization as referred to involves elements of the Regional Leadership Coordination Forum and the participation and participation of: the community; religious leader; traditional leaders; public figure; and other

elements of society. The sanctions given to the community if they violate are stated in Article 7 of Perwali No. 20 of 2020, namely: For individuals: verbal warning or written warning; social work; and an administrative fine of at least Rp. 50,000, - (five thousand rupiah) and a maximum of Rp. 250.000,- (two hundred and fifty thousand rupiah). For business actors, managers, organizers, or persons in charge of places and public facilities: verbal warnings or written warnings; administrative fine with a minimum amount of Rp 250,000, - (two hundred and fifty thousand rupiah) and a maximum of Rp 1.000.000,- (one million rupiah); temporary suspension of business operations; and 4) revocation of business license. In implementing the sanctions as referred to in paragraph (1), the Regional Government shall coordinate with the relevant Ministries/Institutions, the Indonesian National Armed Forces and the Indonesian National Police and the Chairperson of the Regional Task Force(16).

The health policy implementation model specifically describes the elements of implementing health sector policies based on local wisdom in each region(17-20). The pattern of community life in North Maluku as in other regions through Community Development based on local wisdom so that it plays a role in preventing COVID-19 cases, has three main characters, namely community-based, local resource-based and sustainable. The implementation of Community Development as an effort to implement policies for national resilience as a result of the COVID-19 outbreak which is carried out in an integrated manner will produce adaptive capacity, including: mobilize collective resources within group members. The forms of adaptive capacity developed are resilience and flexibility to

maintain the stability of development and management of supporting infrastructures in dealing with and preventing the spread of COVID-19(21).

## CONCLUSION

There are differences in the level of policy implementation from the aspect of resources, bureaucracy and disposition related to evaluation model of the Covid 19 health protocol policy in Ternate City and Tidore City. We, researchers suggest that resources of good quality and quantity of resources should be optimized so that the implementation of health protocols can run more optimally. Improve HR skills and improve the readiness of facilities and infrastructure. For bureaucracy, implementation according to SOP and reporting system to be more structured, it is better to provide standard information delivery procedures and communication procedures between related agencies. For the attitude/disposition aspect, socialization should be carried out more widely and evenly, especially on islands, as well as increasing discipline as traders in the market which were previously quite difficult to parse. Although there is no difference from the communication aspect, because in both regions there is still a lot of inadequate communication, strategic and effective communication and coordination techniques are needed to achieve the target of prevention and control of covid 19.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Acknowledgments are especially addressed to funders or research donors in this case the Health Polytechnic of the Ministry of Health of Ternate. Thank you also to those who have helped carry out this research. This research is registered with a code of ethics number LB.02.04/2.3/182/2021.

## REFERENCES

1. Tizard IR, Musser JM. COVID-19: Not just another respiratory virus—2020. *Great American Diseases*. 2022;345.
2. Kemenkes RI. Update Kasus Covid-19 di Indonesia. Jakarta: Kementerian Kesehatan RI, 2020.
3. Zhang L, Welsch RE, Cao Z. The transmission, infection prevention, and control during the COVID-19 Pandemic in China: A retrospective study. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*. 2022;19(5):3074.
4. Brust KB, Papineni V, Columbus C, Arroliga AC, editors. COVID-19—from emerging global threat to ongoing pandemic crisis. *Baylor University Medical Center Proceedings*; 2022: Taylor & Francis.
5. Worldometer. Covid 19 Coronavirus Pandemic United State of America: Worldometer; 2021 [cited 2021 8 Februari]. Available from: <https://www.worldometers.info/coronavirus/>.
6. Pemerintah Prov. Maluku Utara. Data Kasus COVID-19 di Provinsi Maluku Utara. Ternate: Pemerintah Prov. Maluku Utara; 2020.
7. Protokol Kesehatan Bagi Masyarakat Di Tempat Dan Fasilitas Umum Dalam Rangka Pencegahan Dan Pengendalian Corona Virus Disease 2019 (Covid-19) No. HK.01.07/Menkes/382/2020 (2020).
8. Abujuri F, Rahayu A. Implementasi Program Penanggulangan Penyakit Demam Berdarah Dengue (Dbd) Di Puskesmas Soasio Kota Tidore Kepulauan. *Jurnal Serambi Sehat*. 2021;14(3):1-9.
9. Akbar, Muhammad Ikhsan, et al. "Assessing the service quality at health service facilities during the COVID-19 pandemic in North Buton District, Indonesia." *Public Health of Indonesia* 8.4 (2022): 116-122.
10. Oo WH, Hoban E, Gold L, Than KK, La T, Thi A, et al. Community demand for comprehensive primary health care from malaria volunteers in South-East Myanmar: a qualitative study. *Malaria journal*. 2021;20:1-12.
11. Johnston BM, Burke S, Kavanagh PM, O'Sullivan C, Thomas S, Parker S. Moving beyond formulae: a review of international population-based resource allocation policy and implications for Ireland in an era of healthcare reform. *HRB Open Research*. 2021;4:121.
12. Kogoya W, Rantetampang A, Msen Y, Mallongi A. Factors Affecting the Satisfaction of Employees Civil Service in the Health Ministry District Tolikara. *International Journal of Science and Healthcare Research*. 2018;3(3).
13. Azmi NA, Isa SZM, Mahmud A. Human Resource Management in the Healthcare Setting During COVID-19 Pandemic: Policy Recommendations, Implementation Challenges, and the Way Forward. *Malaysian Journal of Medicine & Health Sciences*. 2022;18(3).
14. Xiao H, Wang X. Fiscal transparency practice, challenges, and possible solutions: lessons from Covid 19. *Public Money & Management*. 2023:1-12.
15. Knill C, Steinebach Y, Zink D. How policy growth affects policy implementation: bureaucratic overload and policy triage. *Journal of European Public Policy*. 2023:1-28.
16. Walikota Ternate. Peraturan Walikota Ternate No 7 Tahun 2020 tentang Pembentukan Gugus Tugas Percepatan Penanganan Darurat Covid 19 dalam wilayah Kota Ternate. Ternate: Pemerintah Kota Ternate; 2020.
17. Ramdhani A, Ramdhani MA. Konsep umum pelaksanaan kebijakan publik. *Jurnal Publik: Jurnal Ilmiah Bidang Ilmu Administrasi Negara*. 2017;11(1):1-12.



18. Atmoko TP. Implementasi Kebijakan Desa Budaya Dalam Melestarikan Budaya Lokal Di Desa Sendangmulyo, Minggir, Sleman. *Media wisata*. 2018;16(1).
19. Christian E. Implementasi Kebijakan Pariwisata Berdasarkan kearifan Lokal (Studi Kasus Kabupaten Kotawaringin Barat). *Jurnal Ilmu Manajemen dan Akuntansi*. 2019;7:8-14.
20. Howay NN, Jeddawi M, Effendy K, Lukman S. Implementasi Kebijaksanaan Bidang Kesehatan Dalam Peningkatan Derajat Dan Kualitas Pelayanan Kesehatan Masyarakat Di Kabupaten Sorong Provinsi Papua Barat. *VISIONER: Jurnal Pemerintahan Daerah di Indonesia*. 2019;11(2):129-39.
21. Ibrahim A, Nugrahani HSD. Startegi Implementasi Kebijakan Penanganan Covid 19 untuk Ketahanan Nasional Berbasis Community Development (Konsep Pentahelix) Di Propinsi Maluku Utara. *Syntax Literate; Jurnal Ilmiah Indonesia*. 2021;6(2):500-18.